

REPORT OF HEARING	Independent Hearing Commissioners:
PANEL	Robert Schofield (Chair)
	Loretta Lovell
	Tim Aitken
	Kate Taylor
	Pip Burne
TOPIC 7B	Renewable Energy
REPORT DATED	4 May 2023
DATE OF HEARING	14 December 2022

Contents

PART A -	- PRELIMINARY MATTERS	1
1	Introduction	1
1.1	Scope of this report	1
1.2	Statutory considerations	1
1.3	Submissions	2
1.4	Procedural matters	2
1.5	Hearing	2
1.6	Structure of this report	3
PART B -	- EVALUATION	5
2	Overview	5
3	Key Issue 1 – Definitions & General Matters	6
3.1	Proposed Plan provisions	6
3.2	Submissions	5
3.3	Reporting planner's recommendations (s42A report)	5
3.4	Evidence to the hearing	5
3.5	Post hearing information	5
3.6	Evaluation and findings	5
4	Key Issue 2 – General Objectives, Policies, Rules & Methods	7
4.1	Proposed Plan provisions	7
4.2	Submissions	7
4.3	Reporting planner's recommendations (s42A report)	7
4.4	Evidence to the hearing	8
4.5	Post hearing information	8
4.6	Evaluation and findings	3
5	Key Issue 3 – Community-Scale Renewable Electricity Generation	8
5.1	Proposed Plan provisions	8
5.2	Submissions	Э
5.3	Reporting planner's recommendations (s42A report)	Э
5.4	Evidence to the hearing	Э
5.5	Post hearing information	Э
5.6	Evaluation and findings	Э
6	Key Issue 4 – Provisions Relating to Historic Heritage Items	D

6.1	Proposed Plan provisions	10
6.2	Submissions	10
6.3	Reporting planner's recommendations (s42A report)	10
6.4	Evidence to the hearing	11
6.5	Post hearing information	11
6.6	Evaluation and findings	12
PART C -	- SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	13
	- SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	
7		13
7 8	Summary of recommendations	13

List of Submitters and Further Submitters addressed in this Report

Submitter Name	Submission Number(s)
Centralines Limited (Centralines)	S90
Department of Conservation (DOC)	S64
Hawke's Bay Regional Council (HBRC)	S11
Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga (HNZPT)	S55
James Bridge	S105
Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society NZ (Forest & Bird)	\$75
Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited (Te Mata Mushrooms)	S102
Transpower New Zealand Ltd (Transpower)	S79

Further Submitter Name	Further Submission Number(s)
Kāinga Ora - Homes and Communities (Kāinga Ora)	FS23
Ngā hapū me ngā marae o Tamatea (NHMT)	FS5
Forest & Bird	FS9

PART A – PRELIMINARY MATTERS

1 Introduction

1.1 Scope of this report

- 1.1.1 This document details the evaluation and recommended decisions of the Proposed CHBD Plan Hearings Panel on the submissions and evidence on renewable energy matters considered at the Energy, Infrastructure and Transport topic hearing, held on 14 December 2022 at the CHBDC Chambers, Waipawa.
- 1.1.2 The recommendations in this report, together with all of the other recommendations of the Hearing Panel ("the Panel") on submissions on the PDP, will all go before the full Council following the end of the hearings, who will make the formal decisions.
- 1.1.3 Our report focuses on the key issues in contention. Where there is no contention, such as submitter support for certain provisions, or minor matters where proposed changes are recommended in response to submissions, we have adopted the s42A report's recommendations and the underlying evaluation behind such changes.

1.2 Statutory considerations

- 1.2.1 The Panel's Report on Preliminary Matters and Statutory Requirements sets out the statutory framework and requirements for preparing a District Plan, as well as case law guidance for our consideration and recommendations. This framework is not repeated in this report, but must be read in conjunction with this report. This report should be read in conjunction with the Report on Preliminary Matters and Statutory Requirements.
- 1.2.2 This report will refer to the s42A report 'Officer's Report: Renewable Energy' prepared by Ms Stella Morgan.
- 1.2.3 Renewable Energy is covered in the 'Network Utilities & Renewable Energy Section 32 Topic Report'.
- 1.2.4 As submissions on particular aspects of the PDP are considered through hearing reports, officers are required to consider any alternative provisions put forward in the context of what s 32 requires, and when changes are recommended, a further assessment under s 32AA will be provided if the change is a material departure from what was notified. That same obligation to make a further assessment under s 32AA also applies to the Panel if it decides to recommend changes as a result of submissions which materially depart from the notified version.
- 1.2.5 Through Minute #5, the Panel urged submitters to provide the hearings with a further assessment under s 32AA for any changes to the PDP they were seeking.
- 1.2.6 Where the Panel has made amendments to the Plan that are consistent with the recommendations contained within Council officers' s42A and / or right-of-reply reports (and where there are relevant joint witness statements) we have adopted the s32AA analysis contained within those reports (unless expressly stated otherwise). Those reports are part of the public record and are available on the CHBDC website.

- 1.2.7 Where the Panel has made amendments to the PDP that are not contained within Council officers' recommendations, we have undertaken the required s32AA analysis and have incorporated it into the body of our report. We are satisfied that the required substantive assessment has been undertaken.
- 1.2.8 Renewable energy is defined in the RMA as 'energy produced from solar, wind, hydro, geothermal, biomass, tidal, wave and ocean current sources'. The 'benefits to be derived from the use and development of renewable energy' are a matter to be considered by Councils under RMA s7(j).
- 1.2.9 As set out in the Section 32 Network Utilities and Renewable Energy Topic Report, there are a number of higher order planning documents that provide direction and guidance for the preparation and content of the PDP, including the National Policy Statement for Renewable Electricity Generation 2011 (NPS-REG), the Hawke's Bay Regional Resource Management Plan (HBRMP) including the Regional Policy Statement (2006) (RPS), and the Hawke's Bay Regional Coastal Environment Plan (2014) (HBRCP). These documents are discussed in detail within the Section 32 Topic Report.
- 1.2.10 Of particular note, Policy F of the NPS-REG requires district plans to include objectives, policies, and methods (including rules within plans) to provide for the development, operation, maintenance and upgrading of small and community-scale distributed renewable electricity generation from any renewable energy source to the extent applicable to the region or district.

1.3 Submissions

- 1.3.1 This topic report addresses submissions received on the district-wide 'RE Renewable Energy' provisions and associated definitions.
- 1.3.2 There were 8 submitters and 3 further submitters across the whole 'Renewable Energy' topic.
- 1.3.3 There were 32 original submission points, and 14 further submission points.
- 1.3.4 Of the 32 original submission points, 16 submission points were in support.

1.4 Procedural matters

- 1.4.1 There were no pre-hearing meetings or meetings undertaken in accordance with cl8AA of Schedule 1, undertaken on the submissions relating to the Renewable Energy topic prior to the finalisation of this s42A report.
- 1.4.2 No further consultation with any parties regarding the Renewable Energy topic was undertaken since notification of the provisions.
- 1.4.3 Due to a potential conflict of interest, Chairman Schofield recused himself from hearings submissions by Transpower New Zealand, or deliberating on its submissions. Commissioner Lovell acted as chair in all proceedings related to the submission from Transpower.
- 1.4.4 No matters of trade competition were raised.

1.5 Hearing

- 1.5.1 The Energy, Infrastructure and Transport hearing was held on 14 December 2022.
- 1.5.2 Submitters who appeared at the hearing in relation to the Renewable Energy Topic are shown below in Table 1. All evidence can be found on the PDP Hearing Schedule webpage under the

relevant Hearing Topic [https://www.chbdc.govt.nz/services/district-plan/proposed-district-plan/hearings/hearing-stream-7/].

Table 1. Submitters who appeared at Hearing Stream 7: Energy, Infrastructure and Transport in relation
to the Renewable Energy topic

Submitter (Submitter Number)	Represented by/ experts called	Nature of evidence	Key Issue under which evidence is discussed
Transpower (S79, FS18)	Pauline Whitney (planning)	Submitter evidence	Key Issues 1 and 2
HNZPT (S55)	Dean Raymond	Written statement	Key Issue 4

- 1.5.3 Ms Stella Morgan appeared as reporting planner for the CHBDC.
- 1.5.4 Evidence provided by Ms Morgan included:
 - Officer's Report: Renewable Energy ("the s42A report"); and
 - Opening statement (verbal).
- 1.5.5 Following the adjournment of the hearing on 14 December 2022, Minute 20, the twentieth memorandum and direction of the Hearings Panel following Hearing 7 was issued on 20 December 2022. Information was sought from the reporting planner on the definition of 'Environmental Compensation'.
- 1.5.6 A written right-of-reply from the Council's reporting planner was received and circulated on 27 January 2023.

1.6 Structure of this report

- 1.6.1 Given the number, nature and extent of the submissions and further submissions received, we have structured this report according to the key issues identified in the s42A report, rather than present a submission point by submission point evaluation. Many of the submissions addressed the same or related issues and thus a key issue approach avoids undue repetition. There are 4 key issues addressed in this report:
 - Key Issue 1 Definitions & General Matters;
 - Key Issue 2 General Objectives, Policies, Rules & Methods;
 - Key Issue 3 Community-Scale Renewable Electricity Generation; and
 - Key Issue 4 Provisions Relating to Historic Heritage Items.
- 1.6.2 We have structured our evaluation and recommendations on a hierarchical basis, firstly reviewing the overarching issues relating to the topic and those submissions that made general points about the topic, including those seeking a binary relief such as complete withdrawal of relevant plan provisions. This includes definitions.
- 1.6.3 We then turn our evaluation to the higher-level provisions of the District Plan relating to the topic: the objectives and policies and associated matters.
- 1.6.4 Subsequently we consider the associated rules and standards, and, if relevant, methods and anticipated environmental results.
- 1.6.5 Finally, we consider whether there were any minor errors that should be rectified or consequential amendments that may be needed as a result of our recommendations.

1.6.6 The Panel's recommendations for each submission point are listed in the table in Appendix B.

PART B – EVALUATION

2 Overview

- 2.1.1 The RE Renewable Energy chapter of the PDP sits within the 'Energy, Infrastructure, and Transport' section of the PDP, as a 'Strategic Direction' matter. It responds to the requirements of the NPS-REG to enable the sustainable management of renewable electricity generation under the RMA.
- 2.1.2 The ODP does not contain any provisions for renewable energy.
- 2.1.3 In addressing renewable energy, the PDP contains two objectives, six policies and four rules providing for renewable energy infrastructure. This chapter also interrelates with the activities for network utility operators in the NU-Network Utilities chapter of the Plan.

3 Key Issue 1 – Definitions & General Matters

3.1 **Proposed Plan provisions**

3.1.1 Key Issue 1 addresses submissions relating to definitions and general matters relating to the Renewable Energy chapter of the PDP.

3.2 Submissions

- 3.2.1 There were 5 original submission points and 3 further submission points relating to definitions and general matters.
- 3.2.2 One submission sought an amendment to the definition of 'Environmental Compensation' and the remaining four submissions were in support of provisions.

3.3 Reporting planner's recommendations (s42A report)

3.3.1 Forest & Bird (S75.004) sought an amendment to the definition of 'Environmental Compensation' to reflect that environmental compensation and environmental offsetting are not synonymous. This was supported by NHMT (FS5.016) and opposed by Kāinga Ora (FS23.980). The reporting planner did not support the amendment sought, as she considered it would be inconsistent with the way the term is used in the PDP, which is only in relation to renewable energy matters. The reporting planner recommended an amendment to clarify this, inserting text "in relation to renewable energy" at the beginning of the definition.

3.4 Evidence to the hearing

3.4.1 In evidence for Transpower, Ms Pauline Whitney supported the recommendation to retain the Introduction, as sought by Transpower.

3.5 **Post hearing information**

3.5.1 In their 27 January 2023 right-of-reply, the reporting planner reconsidered their view and agreed there many also be a range of other situations where it might be appropriate to consider environmental compensation, not just in relation to renewable energy, and therefore considered constraining it to the provisions relating to renewable energy is not desirable. The reporting planner changed their recommendation and recommended \$75.004 be accepted and the following amendment made to the definition:

'ENVIRONMENTAL COMPENSATION

any action (work, services, financial contribution or restrictive covenants) to compensate for, or offset, the environmental effects of activities that cannot be avoided, remedied, or mitigated, or addressed by a biodiversity offset or biodiversity compensation. Positive measures to correct, balance, or otherwise compensate for the loss of the resource or value affected.'

3.6 Evaluation and findings

3.6.1 The Panel agrees with the reporting planner's recommended text in the right-of-reply, distinguishing between offsetting and compensation. The Panel agrees the definition should be general rather than specifically in relation to renewable energy.

4 Key Issue 2 – General Objectives, Policies, Rules & Methods

4.1 **Proposed Plan provisions**

4.1.1 Key Issue 2 addresses submissions on the objectives, policies, rules and methods in the Renewable Energy chapter.

4.2 Submissions

4.2.1 Fifteen original submission points and 11 further submission points were addressed in this Key Issue. These generally supported the Renewable Energy RE - Objectives, Policies, Rules & Methods, with 2 submission points that sought minor amendments and 2 submission points that sought methods RE-M1 and RE-M2 be reviewed for appropriateness.

4.3 Reporting planner's recommendations (s42A report)

Objective RE-O2

4.3.1 The DOC (S64.030) opposed reference to effects that were 'more than minor' on the basis that this did not align with the NPS-REG. The reporting planner agreed that there was no requirement to have policies that were limited to avoiding, mitigating or offsetting adverse effects that were 'more than minor' and recommended amending RE-O2 as follows:

Rule RE-R1

4.3.2 James Bridge (S105.005) sought an amendment to Rule RE-R1 as the submitter was concerned the rule as drafted only provided for wind generation. The reporting planner disagreed the scope of the rule was limited to wind generation, but was not opposed to the amended wording and recommended the following amendment:

RE-R1 Small-scale Renewable Energy Generation Activities				
All Zones		1. Activity Status: PER Where the following conditions are met: a. In the case of wind		2. Activity status where compliance not achieved: RDIS Matters over which discretion is
		generation, Limited to one wind turbine per site. b. Compliance with: - <u>RE-S1;</u> - <u>RE-S2;</u> - <u>RE-S3;</u> - <u>RE-S4;</u> and - <u>RE-S5</u> .		 restricted: a. The extent to which the amenity of adjacent properties will be adversely affected and the ability to mitigate any adverse effects. b. The character, level and duration of noise and vibration as received at the boundary, or notional boundary, of another site.

Methods

4.3.3 Transpower questioned the relevance of identifying the NPSET (Method RE-M1) and the NES-ET (Method RE-M3) and sought a minor amendment to Method RE-M1 (S79.054). S79.055

RE-O2 Enable renewable electricity generation activities while avoiding, mitigating or offsetting adverse effects **that** are more than minor.

Transpower sought Method RE-M2 be reviewed and questioned whether it is relevant to the Renewable Energy chapter.

4.3.4 The reporting planner considered the NPS-ET and NES-ET were a relevant implementation method for achieving the objectives but would not be opposed to deleting them if the Panel considered it confusing to include them. If the Panel decided to retain these methods, the reporting planner would agree with the minor amendment sought by Transpower to RE-M1 as follows:

RE-M1 National Policy Statement on Electricity Transmission

Sets out an objective and policies to enable the management of the effects of, and on the electricity transmission network under the RMA. The objective and policies are intended to guide decision-makers in drafting plan rules, in making decisions on the notification of resource consents, in the determination of resource consent applications, and in considering notices of requirement for designations for transmission activities.

4.4 Evidence to the hearing

4.4.1 In evidence for Transpower, Ms Pauline Whitney supported the recommendation to retain RE-M1 with amendment, as sought by Transpower, and the recommendation to retain RE-M2.

4.5 **Post hearing information**

4.5.1 No information was included in the right-of-reply in relation to this key issue.

4.6 Evaluation and findings

Objective RE-O2

4.6.1 The Panel agrees with the reporting planner and DOC that the words "that are more than minor" are not necessary in Objective RE-O2 and recommends they are deleted.

Rule RE-R1

4.6.2 The Panel considers the reference to wind turbines is a condition of a permitted activity, and not a broad exclusion of other renewable generation activities, but the rule could be made clearer. The Panel agrees with the reporting planner that the submission by James Bridge (S105.005) should be accepted and the words "In the case of wind generation" be added to RE-R1(1)(a).

Methods

4.6.3 The Panel considers that methods RE-M1 and RE-M2 should be retained in the Renewable Energy chapter and agrees with the reporting planner's recommendation to amend RE-M1 as sought by Transpower to reflect that the NPS-ET also manages effects <u>on</u> the transmission network.

5 Key Issue 3 – Community-Scale Renewable Electricity Generation

5.1 **Proposed Plan provisions**

5.1.1 Key Issue 3 addresses submissions relating to community-scale renewable electricity generation. The PDP as notified contains provisions for 'Small Scale Renewable Electricity Generation Activities' which are defined as 'small-scale and community scale renewable electricity generation at a capacity of no greater than 20 kW for the purpose of using or generating electricity on a particular site, or supplying an immediate community, or connecting into the distribution network, and includes generation using solar, wind, hydro and biomass energy resource'.

5.2 Submissions

5.2.1 There were 9 submission points that sought to include provisions for Community-scale Renewable Electricity Provisions in the Renewable energy chapter of the PDP, all were made by Te Mata Mushrooms. Te Mata Mushrooms has advised they no longer intend to actively pursue these submission points¹, however they have not been formally withdrawn and are therefore discussed still below.

5.3 Reporting planner's recommendations (s42A report)

- 5.3.1 Te Mata Mushrooms sought provisions be inserted into the PDP to provide for Community-scale Renewable Electricity Generation Activities based on a new definition. The reporting planner observed the purpose of these amendments appears to be to differentiate community-scale renewable electricity generation activities from small-scale renewable electricity generation activities, which are limited to 20 kW of energy.
- 5.3.2 The reporting planner was not sure what the demand, nature and scale of such activities would be over the life of the plan and was concerned that the changes could result in a range of potentially significant adverse effects, depending on the size and scale of the immediate community, cluster of farms or businesses being supplied, and the infrastructure required. The reporting planner considered a discretionary activity status to consider activities greater than 20kW appropriate and did not recommend making the requested changes.

5.4 Evidence to the hearing

5.4.1 No evidence was presented at the Hearing on these matters.

5.5 **Post hearing information**

5.5.1 No post hearing information was received on this matter.

5.6 Evaluation and findings

5.6.1 The Panel agrees with the reporting planner's recommendation that the submission points be rejected. The Panel notes no evidence has been provided to demonstrate the need for separate provisions for Community-scale renewable electricity generation activities. The Panel agrees a full discretionary activity status for activities greater than 20kW is appropriate.

¹ Letter from Te Mata Mushrooms dated 18 July 2022, in response to the Ninth Memorandum and Direction of the Hearings Panel following Hearing 3.

6 Key Issue 4 – Provisions Relating to Historic Heritage Items

6.1 **Proposed Plan provisions**

6.1.1 Key Issue 4 addresses submissions seeking amendments to the Renewable Energy chapter to include additional provisions for the protection of Historic Heritage (including Sites and Areas of Significance to Māori).

6.2 Submissions

6.2.1 There were 3 submission points, by HNZPT, seeking amendments to RE-P2, RE-R1, and RE-R4 to include provisions for the protection of Historic Heritage.

6.3 Reporting planner's recommendations (s42A report)

Policy RE-P2

- 6.3.1 The reporting planner agreed with HNZPT (S55.017), given the requirements in RMA s6(e) and s6(f), that it would be appropriate to extend the policy in the manner sought by HNZPT. The reporting planner recommended the following amendment:
 - RE-P2 To provide for the identification, investigation, establishment, development, upgrading, operation and maintenance of new and existing renewable electricity generation activities in a manner that supports the protection of the District's:

 High Natural Character Areas (in CE-SCHED7); and
 Outstanding Natural Features and Landscapes (in NFL-SCHED6).
 Historic Heritage as identified in HH-SCHED2 and Sites and Areas of Significance to Māori as identified in SASM-SCHED3.

Rule RE-R1

6.3.2 The reporting planner noted the notified PDP provisions would require consent for a small-scale renewable generation activity where it impacts on a heritage or cultural item but may not require consent where it is located in the wider site containing the heritage or cultural item. The reporting planner understood HNZPT was concerned with protecting the wider site of a heritage item or site and area of significance to Māori and that this could be important where a small-scale renewable energy project exceeded the rule conditions (i.e., zone standards for height, height in relation to boundary and setback requirements and light and noise provisions). The reporting planner did not support requiring a resource consent for any small-scale renewable generation activity within a site containing an item in SCHED2 or SCHED3 as sought by HNZPT (S55.018) but recommended inserting an additional matter for discretion in Rule RE-R1(2) in the event consent is triggered due to non-compliance with standards. The reporting planner recommended the following amendment:

RE-R1 Small-scale Renewable Energy Generation Activities			
All Zones	1. Activity Status: PER	2. Activity status where compliance not	
		achieved: RDIS	
	Where the following conditions are met:		
	a. Limited to one wind turbine per site.	Matters over which discretion is restricted:	
	b. Compliance with:	a. The extent to which the amenity of	
	i. RE-S1;	adjacent properties will be adversely	
	ii. RE-S2;	affected and the ability to mitigate any	
	iii. RE-S3;	adverse effects.	
	iv. RE-S4; and		

v. RE-S5.	b	 The character, level and duration of noise and vibration as received at the boundary, or notional boundary, of another site.
	c.	. The extent to which the heritage and
		cultural values of any heritage items
		identified in HH-SCHED2 or wāhi tapu,
		wāhi taonga and sites of significance to
		Māori identified in SASM-SCHED3 located
		within the site (if any), will be adversely
		affected and the ability to mitigate any
		<u>effects.</u>

Rule RE-4

6.3.3 Noting Council is required to recognise and provide for the relationship of Māori and their culture (RMA s 6(e)) and the protection of historic heritage from inappropriate subdivision, use and development (RMA S6(f)) as matters of national importance, the reporting planner agreed it was appropriate to provide an additional condition in Rule RE-R4 to this effect. Given the approach in the PDP was to protect heritage items themselves and not the wider site, the reporting planner recommended alternative wording to that requested by HNZPT (S55.019). The reporting planner recommended the following amendment:

Zones	1. Activity Status: DIS	2. Activity status where compliance not
		achieved: NC
	Where the following conditions are met:	
	a. New renewable electricity generation	
	activities:	
	 must not be located within an Outstanding Natural Feature or Landscape, or a High Natural Character Area, identified on the Planning Maps and in NFL- SCHED6 and CE-SCHED7, or 	
	ii. <u>must not be located within 20</u> <u>metres of any Heritage Item</u> <u>identified in HH-SCHED2, or</u> <u>wāhi tapu, wāhi taonga and</u> <u>sites of significance to Māori</u> <u>identified in SASM- SCHED3</u> .	

6.4 Evidence to the hearing

6.4.1 Dean Raymond for HNZPT considered the recommended amendments to RE-R1 and RE-R4 outlined in the S42A report would satisfy the relief sought by HNZPT, and would provide for appropriate recognition and protection of heritage and cultural values.

6.5 **Post hearing information**

6.5.1 No post hearing information was received on this matter.

6.6 Evaluation and findings

Policy RE-P2

6.6.1 The Panel agrees with the reporting planner that Policy RE-P2 should be extended in the manner sought by HNZPT. This would better recognise and provide for RMA matters of significance in s6(e) and s6(f).

Rule RE-R1

6.6.2 The Panel agrees with the reporting planner that it is not appropriate or necessary to require a restricted discretionary activity consent for small-scale renewable energy activities on sites containing (but not necessarily directly affecting) heritage or cultural items as sought by HNZPT. The Panel considers that, if an activity triggers a resource consent due to not meeting the rule conditions (i.e., zone standards for height, height in relation to boundary and setback requirements and light and noise provisions), it is appropriate that effects on heritage and cultural values be a matter over which discretion is restricted. The Panel agrees with the reporting planner's recommended amendment, with a minor amendment to the wording for clarity as the words "if any" are superfluous:

RE-R1 Small-scale Rer	newable Energy Generation Activities	
All Zones	1. Activity Status: PER	2. Activity status where compliance not
		achieved: RDIS
	Where the following conditions are met:	
	c. Limited to one wind turbine per site.	Matters over which discretion is restricted:
	d. Compliance with:	d. The extent to which the amenity of
	vi. RE-S1;	adjacent properties will be adversely
	vii. RE-S2;	affected and the ability to mitigate any
	viii. RE-S3;	adverse effects.
	ix. RE-S4; and	e. The character, level and duration of noise
	x. RE-S5.	and vibration as received at the boundary,
		or notional boundary, of another site.
		f. <u>The extent to which the heritage and</u>
		cultural values of any heritage items
		identified in HH-SCHED2 or wāhi tapu,
		<u>wāhi taonga and sites of significance to</u>
		Māori identified in SASM-SCHED3 located
		within the site, will be adversely affected
		and the ability to mitigate any effects.

Rule RE-R4

6.6.3 A Discretionary Activity consent is required for the construction and commissioning of new renewable electricity generation activities (Rule RE-4), except for projects located within an Outstanding Natural Feature or Landscape, or a High Natural Character Area, identified on the Planning Maps and in NFL-SCHED6 and CE-SCHED7, in which case consent for a Non-complying Activity is required. HNZPT sought an amendment to condition (a) to also include a site containing Historic Heritage as identified in SCHED2, or within an area identified as a Site or area of significance to Māori in SCHED3. The Panel agrees with the reporting planner that, as Council has taken the approach of protecting heritage items themselves and not the wider site, it is

appropriate to provide an additional condition but this should not apply to the whole site. The Panel recommends the following amendment as proposed by the reporting planner:

1. Activity Status: DIS	2. Activity status where compliance not achieved: NC
Where the following conditions are met:	achieveu. NC
 New renewable electricity generation activities: 	
 iii. must not be located within an Outstanding Natural Feature or Landscape, or a High Natural Character Area, identified on the Planning Maps and in NFL- SCHED6 and CE-SCHED7., or 	
iV. <u>must not be located within 20</u> <u>metres of any Heritage Item</u> <u>identified in HH-SCHED2, or</u> <u>wāhi tapu, wāhi taonga and</u> <u>sites of significance to Māori</u>	
	 Where the following conditions are met: b. New renewable electricity generation activities: must not be located within an Outstanding Natural Feature or Landscape, or a High Natural Character Area, identified on the Planning Maps and in NFL-SCHED6 and CE-SCHED7or Must not be located within 20 metres of any Heritage Item identified in HH-SCHED2, or wähi tapu, wähi taonga and

PART C – SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

7 Summary of recommendations

- 7.1.1 A summary table of recommended decisions for each submission point is included as Appendix B.
- 7.1.2 A tracked changes version of recommended amendments is included as Appendix A.

8 Consequential amendments and minor errors

8.1.1 Schedule 1, cl16(2), allows minor and inconsequential amendments to be made to the Plan. No cl16 amendments have been identified for this topic.

Appendix A – Chapter as amended

RE – Renewable Energy

The provisions in this chapter override the respective Zone provisions in Part 3 Area-Specific Matters, unless otherwise specified in this chapter.

Introduction

Renewable energy is defined in the RMA as energy produced from solar, wind, hydro, geothermal, biomass, tidal, wave and ocean current sources.

The New Zealand Government has set a target, under the New Zealand Energy Strategy, for 90% of the country's electricity to be generated from renewable energy resources by the year 2025. The Strategy states that the major energy challenges facing New Zealand are the need to respond to the risks of climate change by reducing greenhouse gas emissions caused by the production and use of energy and the need to deliver clean, secure, affordable energy while managing the environment responsibly. To achieve this, the National Policy Statement on Renewable Electricity Generation (NPSREG) came into effect on 13 May 2011 and sets out an objective and policies to enable the sustainable management of renewable electricity generation under the RMA.

Renewable electricity generation is defined in the NPSREG as the generation of electricity from renewable energy. Renewable electricity generation activities are also defined as the construction, operation and maintenance of structures associated with renewable electricity generation. These include small and community-scale distributed renewable generation activities and the system required to convey electricity to the distribution network and/or the national grid and electricity storage technologies associated with renewable electricity.

Sections 7(i) and 7(j) of the RMA also require all persons exercising functions and powers under the RMA to have particular regard to the effects of climate change and the benefits to be derived from the use and development of renewable energy.

The renewable energy provisions in this part of the Plan recognise renewable energy as an essential natural resource and set direction for activities that convert renewable energy into electricity. This part also interrelates with the activities for network utility operators in the NU-Network Utilities chapter of the Plan.

Objectives

RE-01	Enable and encourage the sustainable use and development of renewable energy resources within the Central Hawke's Bay District.
RE-02	Enable renewable electricity generation activities while avoiding, mitigating or offsetting adverse effects that are more than minor.
Policies	

Commented [A1]: S64.030 Department of Conservation, Report 7B Renewable Energy, Key Issue

RE-P1	To provide for the use and development of renewable energy resources of the District for electricity generation in recognition of the particular local, regional and national benefits in relation to climate change, national energy production and social and economic wellbeing.	
RE-P2	To provide for the identification, investigation, establishment, development, upgrading, operation and maintenance of new and existing renewable electricity generation activities in a manner that supports the protection of the District's:	
	 High Natural Character Areas (in CE-SCHED7); and Outstanding Natural Features and Landscapes (in NFL-SCHED6).; and Historic Heritage as identified in HH-SCHED2 and Sites and Areas of Significance to Māori as identified in SASM-SCHED3. 	C
RE-P3	To recognise the environmental, functional, operational and technical constraints of managing new and existing renewable electricity generation activities.	R
RE-P4	To provide for small-scale renewable electricity generation activities.	
RE-P5	To protect renewable electricity generation activities from reverse sensitivity effects.	
RE-P6	To recognise that in some circumstances not all significant environmental effects of renewable electricity generation activities can be avoided or remedied. In determining if a proposal is consistent with sustainable management, regard will be had to any environmental compensation or mitigation measures offered by the applicant as part of the proposal.	

Rule Overview Table

Use/activity	Rule Number
Small-scale Renewable Energy Generation Activities	RE-R1
Works or activities associated with the on-going operation, maintenance or upgrading of existing, lawfully established Renewable Electricity Generation Activities	RE-R2
Wind Monitoring Masts	RE-R3

Commented [A2]: S55.018 HNZPT, Report 7B Renewable Energy, Key Issue 4

Construction and commissioning of newRE-R4Renewable Electricity Generation ActivitiesImage: Construction of the second second

Rules

It is important to note that, in addition to the provisions in this chapter, a number of other Part 2: District-Wide Matters chapters also contain provisions that may be relevant to activities involving renewable energy.

All Zones	1. Activity Status: PER	2. Activity status where compliance not achieved:	
	Where the following conditions	RDIS	
	are met:		
	a. In the case of wind generation,	Matters over which discretion	
	Limited to one wind turbine per	is restricted:	Commented [A3]: S105.005 James Bridge, Report
	site.	a. The extent to which the	Renewable Energy, Key Issue 2
	b. Compliance with:	amenity of adjacent	
	i. RE-S1;	properties will be adversely	
	ii. RE-S2;	affected and the ability to	
	iii. RE-S3;	mitigate any adverse effects.	
	iv. RE-S4; and	b. The character, level and	
	v. RE-S5.	duration of noise and	
		vibration as received at the	
		boundary, or notional	
		boundary, of another site.	
		c. The extent to which the	
		heritage and cultural values	
		of any heritage items	
		identified in HH-SCHED2 or	
		wāhi tapu, wāhi taonga and	
		sites of significance to Māori	
		identified in SASM-SCHED3	
		located within the site, will	
		be adversely affected and	
		the ability to mitigate any	
		effects.	Commented [A4]: S55.018 HNZPT, Report 7B
		L	Renewable Energy, Key Issue 4
E-R2 Works	or activities associated with the on-go	ing operation, maintenance or	
pgrading of	existing, lawfully established Renewab	le Electricity Generation	
ctivities			
ll Zones	1. Activity Status: PER	2. Activity status where	
		compliance not achieved: DIS	

	Where the following conditions	
	are met:	
	a. The works or activities must be	
	fully contained within the	
	originally consented or	
	authorised footprint of the	
	existing renewable electricity	
	generation activity they are	
	ancillary to.	
	anomary to.	
RE-R3 Wind Mo	nitoring Masts	
General Rural	1. Activity Status: PER	2. Activity status where
Zone		compliance with conditions
20110	Where the following conditions	RE-R3(1)(a), RE-R3(1)(b), RE-
	are met:	R3(1)(d) and/or RE-R3(1)(e) is
	a. Limited to:	not achieved: RDIS
	i. a height of 80m; and	
	ii. must be set back at least	Matters over which discretion
	500m from the boundaries	is restricted:
	of the site	a. The extent to which activities
	b. Must not be located within a	
		on adjacent properties will
	High Natural Character Area,	be adversely affected in
	or Outstanding Natural Feature	terms of visual domination,
	or Landscape, identified on the	noise and vibration, and the
	Planning Maps and in NFL-	ability to mitigate any
	SCHED6 and CE-SCHED7.	adverse effects.
	c. Must not be located within the	b. Location and scale of the
	National Grid Yard.	wind monitoring mast and
	d. A notice of commencement	associated structures.
	must be submitted to the	c. Special technical
	Council prior to the	requirements and
	construction of the mast.	constraints of the wind
	e. The mast and all associated	monitoring mast.
	equipment must be removed	d. The extent to which adverse
	within 5 years of the date of the	effects on Outstanding
	notice of commencement	Natural Features and
	required under condition 4.	Landscapes, and High
	required ander contailor 1.	Natural Character Areas. will
		be avoided, remedied, or
		, ,
		mitigated.
		3. Activity status where
		compliance with condition RE-
		R3(1)(c) is not achieved: NC
		its(i)(c) is not achieved. NC

RE-R4 Construction and commissioning of new Renewable Electricity Generation Activities

All Zones	1. Activity Status: DIS	2. Activity status where
		compliance not achieved: NC
	Where the following conditions	
	are met:	
	a. New renewable electricity	
	generation activities:	
	i must not be located within	
	an Outstanding Natural	
	Feature or Landscape, or a	
	High Natural Character	
	Area, identified on the	
	Planning Maps and in NFL-	
	SCHED6 and CE-SCHED7-,	
	or	
	ii must not be located within	
	20 metres of any Heritage	
	Item as identified in HH-	
	SCHED2, or wāhi tapu, wāhi	
	taonga and sites of	
	significance to Māori	
	identified in SASM-	
	SCHED3.	

Commented [A5]: S55.019 HNZPT, Report 7B Renewable Energy, Key Issue 4

Standards

The following standards apply to small-scale energy generation activities.

RE-S1 Height of buildings and structures					
All Zones	 The height of buildings and structures must comply with the maximum height limits for buildings and structures for the Zone in which the small-scale renewable energy generation activities are located. 				
RE-S2 Height in r	elation to boundary				
All Zones	 On any site adjoining a Residential Zone, Settlement Zone, Large Lot Residential (Coastal) or Rural Lifestyle Zone, no part of a building or structure must exceed a height of 2m plus the shortest horizontal distance between that part of the building and structure and the nearest site boundary. 				

	This standard does not apply to solar panels that are attached to a building and do not protrude more than 500mm from the surface of the roof of the building.
RE-S3 Setbacks	
All Zones	 All new buildings and structures must comply with the minimum setback provisions for buildings and structures from roads and neighbours for the Zone in which the small-scale renewable energy generation activities are located.
RE-S4 Light	
All Zones	 Activities must comply with the provisions of the LIGHT – Light chapter.
RE-S5 Noise	
All Zones	 Activities must comply with the provisions of the NOISE – Noise chapter.

Assessment Matters

For Discretionary Activities, Council's assessment is not restricted to these matters, but it may consider them (among other factors).

RE-AM1 General Matters

- 1. The contribution the proposal will make towards achieving energy policy objectives and/or renewable electricity generation targets of the New Zealand Government.
- 2. The local, regional, and national benefits to be derived from the use and development of renewable energy resources, including the contributions the proposal will make to the:
 - a. Security of electricity supply for current and future generations.
 - b. Increased energy independence for the communities of the District.
 - c. Reduced dependency on imported energy sources.
 - d. Reduction in greenhouse gases.
 - e. Reduction of exposure to fossil fuel volatility.
- Any other benefits or positive effects that the project can demonstrate. This may include adding to and diversifying the District's generation base, increased network resilience, reduced grid investment, local industry development, and price security for the local community.
- 4. The extent to which the location and design of the activity is constrained by environmental, functional, operational and technical requirements, and the extent to which alternative locations and methods have been considered.

- 5. The actual and potential effects of the proposal, with particular consideration of the following:
 - a. Where the proposal is located within High Natural Character Areas, Outstanding Natural Features and Landscapes or Significant Amenity Features identified on the Planning Maps and in scheduled in NFL-SCHED6 and CE-SCHED7 of the Plan.
 - b. The extent to which the proposal will affect the natural character of the coastal environment and rural environment.
 - c. The extent to which the proposal will adversely affect cultural values, including wāhi tapu, wāhi taonga and sites of significance to Māori identified in HH-SCHED2 and SASM-SCHED3 of the Plan.
 - d. The extent to which the proposal will adversely impact on dwellings, sensitive activities, key public places including roads and recreation areas, and existing and future urban growth areas.
 - e. The extent to which any aspects of the proposal can be sited or designed to reduce the visibility of any structures, including the potential to locate facilities underground where practicable.
- 6. The effect of the overall scale of the proposed development, including the number of structures, their height, the visual effect of the development as a whole, staging of the development and temporary effects as a result of construction.
- 7. The extent to which the proposal will affect amenity values of the surrounding environment with particular regard being given to the effects of the development on residential dwellings, including consideration of any potential adverse effects on amenity values discernible at the dwelling including:
 - a. If wind turbines are involved, blade glint resulting from the reflection of the sun from turbine blades.
 - If wind turbines are involved, shadow flicker resulting from sunlight on the rotating blades casting a shadow that rapidly moves across the windows of a dwelling within 10 rotor diameters distance of a turbine.
 - c. The extent of the ecological effects of the proposal, in particular:
 - d. The extent to which significant indigenous vegetation and significant habitats of indigenous fauna are affected, including Significant Natural Areas identified in ECO-SCHED5 of the Plan.
 - e. The potential effects on indigenous birds or other indigenous fauna, either migratory species or resident populations on site.
 - f. The sensitivity of the site to disturbance.
 - g. The extent of any proposed earthworks and the degree to which stormwater runoff and the effects on local catchments can be managed.
- The effects on archaeological sites (including the need for archaeological authorities under the Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga Act), heritage and cultural values, including any heritage items identified in HH-SCHED2, SASM-SCHED3 and TREE-SCHED4 of the Plan.
- 9. The extent to which adverse effects will be avoided, remedied or mitigated by the proposed siting, colour and design of structures, including ancillary structures.
- 10. The electromagnetic effects of the proposal, including on existing telecommunications, broadcast and other signals.

- 11. Cumulative effects of the proposal in the context of wider and ongoing renewable energy development, and the use of review conditions to manage these effects.
- 12. Where the adverse effects of renewable electricity generation activities cannot be practically avoided, remedied or mitigated, the relevance and appropriateness of any offset measures and/or environmental compensation that is of benefit to the local environment and affected community.
- 13. Where particular adverse effects of renewable energy are not fully known or are uncertain, the relevance and appropriateness of any adaptive management measures to avoid, remedy or mitigate any such effects.

RE-AM2 Noise

1. The actual and potential noise effects of the proposal, and the ability (if relevant) to meet NZS 6806:2010 Acoustics Wind Farm Noise, and other relevant standards such as NZS 6802:1991 Assessment of Environmental Sound and NZS 6803:1999 Acoustics – Construction noise.

RE-AM3 Traffic

- 1. The effects of the proposal on traffic safety.
- 2. The effects of traffic and vehicle movements as a result of the proposal and the extent that traffic or site management plans can be implemented to mitigate effects.

RE-AM4 Natural Hazards

1. The extent to which the activity may exacerbate or be adversely affected by natural hazards.

RE-AM5 Earthworks

1. The extent of any earthworks, including access tracks, roads and building platforms and the rehabilitation proposed.

Methods

Methods, other than the above rules, for implementing the policies:

RE-M1 National Policy Statement on Electricity Transmission

Sets out an objective and policies to enable the management of the effects of, and on, the electricity transmission network under the RMA. The objective and policies are intended to guide decision-makers in drafting plan rules, in making decisions on the notification of resource consents, in the determination of resource consent applications, and in considering notices of requirement for designations for transmission activities.

RE-M2 National Environmental Standard for Electricity Transmission

Commented [A6]: S75.094 Transpower, Report 7B Renewable Energy, Key Issue 2

Provides national environmental standards for electricity transmission for the National Grid. The Regulations categorize activities that relate to the operation, maintenance, upgrading, relocation or removal of existing transmission lines.

RE-M3 New Zealand Electricity Code of Practice for Electricity Safety Distances 2001 (NZECP 34:2001)

Sets minimum safe electrical distance requirements for overhead electric line installations and other works associated with the supply of electricity from generation stations to end users. The minimum safe distances have been set primarily to protect persons, property, vehicles and mobile plant from harm or damage from electrical hazards.

Principal Reasons

The principal reasons for adopting the policies and methods:

The above objectives and policies recognise the benefits of renewable energy resources in maintaining or enhancing electricity generation capacity and security of supply while reducing reliance on fossil fuels and reducing or displacing greenhouse gas emissions. The Plan recognises that the use of renewable energy for electricity generation will have positive effects on the environment and community.

The investigation, identification and assessment of potential sites and energy sources for the development of renewable electricity generation activities is supported by the rules of this Plan as part of recognising the need to meet or exceed the 90% national target for the generation of electricity from renewable energy. The rules also support the development and operation of small and community-scale distributed renewable electricity generation activities where the benefits are local and significant adverse effects are avoided, remedied or mitigated.

Renewable electricity generation activities need to locate where the renewable energy resources are available. As such, there are environmental, functional, operational or technical constraints associated with the construction, operation, maintenance or upgrading of renewable electricity generation activities. These constraints need to be balanced against other important factors, such as the sensitivity of the landscape and areas of cultural, historic or ecological importance.

Where significant adverse effects of renewable electricity generation activities cannot be practically avoided or remedied, regard will be had to any mitigation measures and/or environmental compensation offered as part of a proposal by applicants for resource consents, including measures or compensation which benefit the environment and/or the community.

Renewable electricity generation activities need to be protected from sensitive activities locating in close proximity to them and compromising their ability to operate. This can be addressed by the consideration of buffer areas and boundary setbacks when renewable electricity generation activities are established and consideration of the potential for existing renewable electricity generation activities to be compromised by reverse sensitivity effects where new sensitive activities seek to establish near them.

Anticipated Environmental Results

The environmental results anticipated from the policies and methods:

Recognition of the benefits (locally/regionally/nationally) of the
District's renewable energy resources and the electricity generation
facilities that utilise such resources in the sustainable management of
the District's resources.

- RE-AER2 A range of renewable electricity generation initiatives supported in a manner that integrates them with the protection of the District's identified High Natural Character Areas, Outstanding Natural Landscapes and Features, Significant Natural Areas, Heritage Items and archaeological sites.
- RE-AER3 The District's communities can be self-sufficient in energy and meet the majority of their electricity needs from a diverse range and scale of renewable energy resources.
- RE-AER4 Individuals and communities can choose to generate their own electricity from renewable energy resources.
- **RE-AER5** Maintenance of the amenity values of the surrounding area.

Appendix B – Summary of recommendations on submissions

Table: Summary of recommended decisions on submissions and further submissions

Submissi on Point	Submitter (S) / Further Submitter (FS)	Provision	Summary of Decision Requested	Key Issue	Officer Recommendation (as per s42A report unless otherwise stated)	Panel Recommendation	Amendments to Proposed Plan?
S102.010	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	Definitions	Add a new definition for 'Community-scale Renewable Electricity Generation Activity' as follows: 'COMMUNITY-SCALE RENEWABLE ELECTRICITY GENERATION ACTIVITY means renewable electricity generation for the purpose of supplying an immediate community, cluster of farms, or businesses to secure electricity supply or to connect into the distribution network.'	Key Issue 3	Reject	Reject	No
\$102.025	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-PXX (new policy)	And add a new policy in the 'Renewable Energy' chapter of the Proposed Plan as follows: 'To provide for community-scale renewable electricity generation activities.'	Key Issue 3	Reject	Reject	No
S102.027	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-RXX (new rule)	Add a new rule for 'Community-scale Renewable Electricity Generation Activities' as follows: 'RE-R5 Community-scale Renewable Energy[Electricity?] Generation Activities 1. Activity Status: RDIS, Non-notified Where the following conditions are met:a. Compliance with: i. RE-S1; ii. RE-S2; iii. RE-S2; iii. RE-S3; iv. RE-S4; and v. RE-S5.'	Key Issue 3	Reject	Reject	No
•							
S102.026	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-R1	Retain RE-R1.	Key Issue 3	Accept	Accept	No
S102.028	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-S1	Amend RE-S1 to add in reference to 'Community-scale Renewable Electricity Generation Activities'.	Key Issue 3	Reject	Reject	No

Submissi on Point	Submitter (S) / Further Submitter (FS)	Provision	Summary of Decision Requested	Key Issue	Officer Recommendation (as per s42A report unless otherwise stated)	Panel Recommendation	Amendments to Proposed Plan?
•							
S102.029	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-S2	Amend RE-S2 to add in reference to 'Community-scale Renewable Electricity Generation Activities'.	Key Issue 3	Reject	Reject	No
•							
S102.030	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-S3	Amend RE-S3 to add in reference to 'Community-scale Renewable Electricity Generation Activities'.	Key Issue 3	Reject	Reject	No
S102.031	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-S4	Amend RE-S4 to add in reference to 'Community-scale Renewable Electricity Generation Activities'.	Key Issue 3	Reject	Reject	No
S102.032	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-S5	Amend RE-S5 to add in reference to 'Community-scale Renewable Electricity Generation Activities'.	Key Issue 3	Reject	Reject	No
•							
\$75.004	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society NZ (Forest & Bird)	ENVIRONMEN TAL COMPENSATI ON (Definition)	Amend the definition of 'Environmental Compensation' as follows: 'Environmental Compensation: any action (work, services, financial contribution or restrictive covenants) to compensate for, or offset, the environmental effects of activities that cannot be avoided, remedied, er mitigated or addressed by a biodiversity offset or biodiversity compensation. Positive measures to correct, balance, or otherwise compensate for the loss of the resource or value affected.'	Key Issue 1	Accept (ROR 27 Jan 2023)	Accept	Yes
FS23.98	Kāinga Ora - Homes and Communities		Disallow	Key Issue 1	Accept in part	Accept in part	
FS5.016	Nga hapu me nga marae o Tamatea		Allow	Key Issue 1	Accept in part	Accept in part	
S79.014	Transpower New Zealand Ltd	RENEWABLE ELECTRICITY GENERATION ACTIVITIES (Definition)	Retain definition of 'Renewable Electricity Generation Activities'.	Key Issue 1	Accept	Accept	No

Submissi on Point	Submitter (S) / Further Submitter (FS)	Provision	Summary of Decision Requested	Key Issue	Officer Recommendation (as per s42A report unless otherwise stated)	Panel Recommendation	Amendments to Proposed Plan?
S11.006	Hawke's Bay Regional Council	RE - Renewable Energy	No changes	Key Issue 1	Accept	Accept	No
•							
S90.025	Centralines Limited	RE - Renewable Energy	Retain the 'RE - Renewable Energy' chapter as notified.	Key Issue 1	Accept	Accept in part	No
S79.053	Transpower New Zealand Ltd	RE - Introduction	Retain 'RE - Introduction'.	Key Issue 1	Accept	Accept	No
FS9.413	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 1	Accept	Accept	
S102.022	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-01	Retain RE-O1 as proposed.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No
S64.029	Department of Conservation	RE-O1	Retain RE-O1.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No
FS9.312	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept		
S102.023	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-02	Retain RE-O2 as proposed.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept in part	No
•							
S64.030	Department of Conservation	RE-02	Amend RE-O2 to align with the NPS-REG.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	Yes
FS9.313	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	

Submissi on Point	Submitter (S) / Further Submitter (FS)	Provision	Summary of Decision Requested	Key Issue	Officer Recommendation (as per s42A report unless otherwise stated)	Panel Recommendation	Amendments to Proposed Plan?
S64.031	Department of Conservation	RE-P1	Retain RE-P1.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No
FS9.314	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	
S64.032	Department of Conservation	RE-P2	Retain RE-P2.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No
FS9.315	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	
S64.033	Department of Conservation	RE-P3	Retain RE-P3.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No
FS9.316	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	
S102.024	Te Mata Mushrooms Land Company Limited	RE-P4	Retain RE-P4 as proposed.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No
S64.034	Department of Conservation	RE-P4	Retain RE-P4.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No
FS9.317	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	
S64.035	Department of Conservation	RE-P5	Retain RE-P5.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No
FS9.318	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	
S64.036	Department of Conservation	RE-P6	Retain RE-P6.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No

Submissi on Point	Submitter (S) / Further Submitter (FS)	Provision	Summary of Decision Requested	Key Issue	Officer Recommendation (as per s42A report unless otherwise stated)	Panel Recommendation	Amendments to Proposed Plan?
FS9.319	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	
S105.005	James Bridge	RE-R1	Amend RE-R1 as follows: '1. Activity Status: PER Where the following conditions are met: a. In the case of wind generation, limited to one wind turbine per site. b. Compliance with: ' Or other appropriate amendments to explicitly provide for all types of renewable energy generation activities as anticipated by RE-P4.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	Yes
S64.037	Department of Conservation	RE-R4	Retain RE-R4.	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No
FS9.320	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	
S79.054	Transpower New Zealand Ltd	RE-M1	Review the appropriateness of RE-M1 within the 'RE - Renewable Energy' chapter. Amend RE-M1 as follows: 'Sets out an objective and policies to enable the management of the effects on and of the electricity transmission network under the RMA. The objective and policies are intended to guide decision-makers in drafting plan rules, in making decisions on the notification of resource consents, in the determination of resource consent applications, and in considering notices of requirement for designations for transmission activities.'	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	No
FS9.414	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of New Zealand Incorporated		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept	Accept	
S79.055	Transpower New Zealand Ltd	RE-M2	Review the appropriateness of RE-M2 within the 'RE - Renewable Energy' chapter.	Key Issue 2	Accept in part	Accept in part	No
FS9.415	Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of		Allow	Key Issue 2	Accept in part	Accept in part	

Submissi on Point	Submitter (S) / Further Submitter (FS)	Provision	Summary of Decision Requested	Key Issue	Officer Recommendation (as per s42A report unless otherwise stated)	Panel Recommendation	Amendments to Proposed Plan?
	New Zealand Incorporated						
\$55.017	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	RE-P2	Add the following clause to RE-P2: ' 3. Historic Heritage as identified in HH-SCHED2 and Sites and Areas of Significance to Māori as identified in SASM-SCHED3.'	Key Issue 4	Accept	Accept	Yes
S55.018	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	RE-R1	 Add the following clauses to RE-R1: '1. Activity Status: PER Where the following conditions are met: a b. Compliance with: c. The activity is not within a site containing Historic Heritage as identified in SCHED2, and is not within an area identified as a Site or area of significance to Māori in SCHED3. 2. Activity status where compliance not achieved: RDIS Matters over which discretion is restricted: a b c. The effects on historic heritage and cultural values.' 	Key Issue 4	Accept in part	Accept in part	Yes
\$55.019	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	RE-R4	Amend RE-R4(1)(a) as follows: '1. Activity Status: DIS Where the following conditions are met: a. New renewable electricity generation activities must not be located within an Outstanding Natural Feature or Landscape, or a High Natural Character Area, identified on the Planning Maps and in NFL-SCHED6 and CE- SCHED7, a site containing Historic Heritage as identified in SCHED2, or within an area identified as a Site or area of significance to Māori in SCHED3.'	Key Issue 4	Accept in part	Accept in part	Yes